



**Quarterly Report**  
**GLOBAL CIVIL-MILITARY RELATIONS PROGRAM**  
**USAID Cooperative Agreement No. AEP-A-00-98-00014-00**  
**January 1 to March 31, 2001**

**I. SUMMARY**

During this quarter, the *Partnership for Democratic Governance* (PDGS), a global information, education and development alliance, made progress toward achieving the two objectives outlined in its revised third year workplan: ensuring that the PDGS completes the work it committed to deliver in the Cooperative Agreement and establishing a stronger foundation for the development and expansion of the PDGS and its activities in the future.

The PDGS is managed by the National Democratic Institute for International Affairs (NDI) and includes three global partners: *The Center for Civil-Military Relations at the Monterey Naval Post-Graduate School* (CCMR), *Seguridad Estrategica Regional para el 2000* (SER), and the *Institute for Security and Development Studies* (ISDS)

NDI's achievements this quarter include: assisting SER in redesigning and expanding the PDGS website; working with CCMR to publish a series of research papers on the web and to develop a first draft of a 7-day curriculum to increase civilians' knowledge of defense and security affairs; conducting a mid-term assessment and reorientation of USAID's Office of Transition Initiatives (OTI)-funded Indonesia program; and developing and submitting to USAID concept papers for civil-military work in Columbia, Cambodia, and Peru.

During this period, CCMR worked on completing some of its cases studies, began writing a series of short comparative papers, and drafted and made substantive progress on producing a civil-military curriculum. SER continued the expansion of the PDGS website. Throughout January and February, ISDS's contribution to the partnership was sub-optimal. However, in March, ISDS presented four drafts of papers long overdue, submitted their workplan and budget for year three, and provided NDI with a document showing the history of its involvement in security and governance in the Philippines and in Asia.

The PDGS held its yearly conference from March 26 to 28 in Washington, D.C. During the conference the partnership assessed its strengths and weaknesses. The partners highlighted three key strengths: the PDGS's developed network of professionals and organizations who can provide expertise on security and governance issues globally, its collection of resource materials including research papers and training materials, and its global frequently-accessed web-based database. The partnership argued that a key weakness stemmed from the structure of the

cooperative agreement which did not provide strong enough incentives for USAID mission buy-in. As part of this three-day conference, PDGS invited guests from think tanks, universities, and federal agencies to participate in an afternoon session that discussed the importance of civil-military relations in democracy building.

## **II. BACKGROUND**

The liberalization of a military or military-dominated regime does not always lead to the establishment of a stable, consolidated democracy. In many cases, the legacy of military influence in domestic political affairs leaves newly elected leaders without the expertise or institutional mechanisms necessary to assert civilian control of the military. The situation may be further complicated by the military which views the new leaders as incompetent and thus, resists attempts by civilians to assert control. If this dynamic unfolds, it can slow democratic development; in the worst case, it can catalyze attempts by the military to reassert its control over government.

In July 1998, the National Democratic Institute for International Affairs (NDI) signed a cooperative agreement with the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) to create a Partnership for Democratic Governance and Security (PDGS)—an information, education and development alliance to promote and support democratic governance through bolstering the capacity of civilian institutions to establish and strengthen their leadership, management, and oversight of their military forces.

PDGS programs are created and conducted with the cooperation of national legislatures, political parties, civic organizations, academic institutions, the media and civilian elements of the defense establishment in newly emerging democracies. PDGS engages in three core resource-providing activities:

- The publication of a series of practical resource documents for defense policymakers in the defense policymaking community of newly emerging democracies—government officials, legislators, journalists, civic activists, academics and military officials.
- The development of a web-based governance and security clearinghouse that provides a database of laws and constitutional provisions related to defense oversight, policy directives, “white papers,” case studies and civil-military publications that can be easily accessed by policymakers in democratizing states.
- The development of an educational module based on lessons in diverse settings learned on how to establish and strengthen civilian capacity in military oversight and defense policymaking through the use of democratic processes and procedures.

In addition, PDGS conducts workshops, consultations, and programs dealing with the various aspects of establishing and strengthening a functional system of democratic civilian control of the armed forces.

### **III. PROGRAM ACTIVITIES**

#### **Center for Civil-Military Relations (CCMR)**

*For PDGS, CCMR's responsibilities include: collecting information materials for the governance and security online clearinghouse; writing resource papers and case studies; and developing a syllabus for a civil-military relations curriculum.*

CCMR continued to work on its case studies and resource tools this quarter. It produced a draft for one of three commissioned short papers, "The National Security Framework: What do Countries Legislate?" and provided NDI with a first draft of a civil-military relations curriculum.

#### **The Institute for Strategic and Development Studies (ISDS)**

*ISDS's responsibilities in the PDGS include writing resource papers and assisting in gathering materials for the PDGS website.*

During this quarter, NDI initially froze ISDS's subgrant drawdown due to its failure to provide a workplan and budget for year three and submit long-overdue resource papers. These were provided in the first week of March. In the new workplan, ISDS proposes, among other tasks to assume responsibility for the Asia Governance Today section of the PDGS website. It plans to write short analytical articles on current developments on democratizing civil-military relations in selected countries in Asia. ISDS also proposes to hold three seminars/workshops in the Philippines on promoting democratic civil-military relations with civilian institutions that exercise oversight functions over the military. Participants would include members of congress, members of the judiciary and the constitutional commissions (Commission on Audit, Civil Service Commission, Commission on Elections, and Commission on Human Rights), the media, representatives of civil society, and academics.

ISDS provided drafts of four research papers: "Thailand's Road to Civilian Control: the Changing Place for the Military;" "ROC's Civil-Military Relations in the Context of Democratic Governance and Security;" "Civil-Military Relations in Post-Authoritarian Indonesia;" and "Restoring and Strengthening Civilian Control: Best Practices in Civil-Military Relations in the Philippines."

At NDI's request, the Institute provided a detailed account of some of the activities that it has been able to engage, in part, due to the institutional support provided by PDGS. during the past couple of years, ISDS has participated in training programs on defense and security in civilian and military schools and has conducted policy briefings and consultations with government officials (both civilian and military), politicians, business, media, and the diplomatic corps. The Institute is currently participating in the South China Sea Dialogue Series, an ongoing series of workshops that brings together representatives of governmental and nongovernmental agencies and institutes (including academics) who attempt to arrive at a better understanding of, and generate appropriate policy responses, to the security issues surrounding the South China Sea problem. In addition, ISDS is also participating in the ASEAN expert's meeting on the United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea (UNCLOS) series that intends to provide a

framework for peaceful negotiation and serve as an additional building block for confidence and trust in the region. Moreover, ISDS is taking part in the ASEAN-ISIS Cooperation Program, a three-year joint undertaking with ASEAN-ISIS (Institute of Strategic and International Studies) and the Joint Center for Asian Pacific Studies (JCAPS). This particular project is also supported by the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) which hopes to strengthen the research, conference, and dialogue activities among members of the network.

## **SER en el 2000 (SER)**

*SER en el 2000's key responsibility is to design and maintain the PDGS website ([www.pdgs.org.ar](http://www.pdgs.org.ar) or [www.pdgs.org](http://www.pdgs.org)) and online clearinghouse.*

During this quarter, SER and NDI continued to work together in a major undertaking to restructure and redesign the PDGS website. Implementation of all the proposed changes will continue during the remaining months of the partnership. The website will serve as PDGS's legacy once funding runs out.

In addition to the restructuring of the website, SER continued to fulfill its obligation of posting new content: completed case studies, resource materials and contact information.

Aside from PDGS, SER en el 2000 has distinguished itself through its efforts to promote democracy in Latin America. Founded during Argentina's journey to democracy, SER has held seminars and conferences, and published papers on various aspects of security sector reform. It publishes a Spanish language journal that attempts to foster debate on security, defense, and civil-military relations issues at the national, regional, and international levels. In addition, the organization has also worked on research projects that have led to the development of government recommendations and bills. Key bills that SER helped work on include: the National Defense Act, the Armed Forces Reorganization Act, and the Intelligence Act. While a member of PDGS, SER has worked with other Latin American organizations to promote democratization and security sector reform on the continent.

## **National Democratic Institute**

### *Program Management*

During this quarter, NDI continued to give extensive feedback on all of the case studies and resource papers submitted by CCMR and ISDS. NDI also sent information about global intelligence legislation and constitutions to SER for addition to the website.

### *PDGS Conference from March 26 to 28*

From March 26 through 28, the Partnership for Democratic Governance and Security held its annual conference for partners. Hosted by NDI in Washington D.C., the conference brought together the directors of each of the partner institutions. The partners discussed the accomplishments of the partnership as well as their strategy and goals for the future. The

conference ended with a two-and-a-half hour information session held at NDI for policymakers, academics, and practitioners of international affairs.

The first half of the conference addressed the current status of the PDGS and the future of the cooperative agreement from a logistical and funding standpoint. The partners were addressed by Keri Eisenbeis, the administrator of the PDGS grant at USAID. Eisenbeis described the challenges that she faced in advocating for USAID mission funding for programs in civil-military relations. She suggested the partners take advantage of the conference to develop the structure that they would like to see the partnership take if it were to receive additional funding from USAID.

During the second half of the conference, NDI Senior Advisor on Global Civil-Military Relations Dr. Eva Busza spoke about her experiences in trying to foster USAID interest in funding civil-military programs in Indonesia, Cambodia, and Peru. Her experiences prompted a discussion on the contrast between funders' desires for immediate results and the slow nature of progress in civil-military relations. The group also used this session to discuss the future of PDGS. The group decided that if they are to stay together as a unit, the partnership would require organizational changes. Greater communication among the partners was needed as well as a clear and fair distribution of the workload. The partners discussed what the problems had been in the past and offered suggestions for the future. During this and other sessions, the group examined how the structure of PDGS affected its ability to receive funding. It was decided that the partnership should expand its solicitation for funding to include privately and publicly funded foundations. The group also determined that funding opportunities from the U.S. federal government are currently difficult to assess due to the change in administration. The partners decided that the best approach would be to first determine what products and services PDGS has to offer and then determine what is the best strategy for marketing these.

In assessing the PDGS's strengths, the partners highlighted three key features. First, the PDGS has developed a network of professionals and organizations who can provide expertise on security and governance issues. Second, it has developed a wealth of resource materials including research papers and training materials. Third, it provides a global web-based database which is expanding and growing.

With regard to the latter, Jaime Garreta, president of SER en el 2000, stressed the importance of the PDGS website to SER as a whole, stating that the organization's livelihood depends on the website. Garreta expressed anxiety regarding the website's fate after the partnership ends in July. He emphasized the website's uniqueness in that it is the only existing tool that provides extensive information on the subject of civil-military relations to the international community. SER documented that the website was receiving over 1,400 hits a month. Information collected by SER regarding web usage indicates that the PDGS website is increasingly reaching its designated audience of parliamentarians, civilian government officials, and NGOs in democratizing states.

To conclude the partner's conference, NDI invited guests from federal agencies, the U.S. Congress, universities, and think tanks to participate in a discussion regarding the importance of civil-military relations in democracy-building. The session began with brief introductions about

the partners' work in civil-military relations followed by a question-and-answer period. Intended to generate support for working on improving global civil-military relations, the conference stressed the need to incorporate civil-military relations into democracy work. The partners took this opportunity to showcase the important resources the PDGS has developed over the past three years of the partnership.

### *Civil-Military Relations Assessment Mission and Program Development in Cambodia*

Between March 1 and 5, Busza traveled to Cambodia to meet with officials and experts in Cambodian civil-military affairs, including: Kassie Neou, director of the Cambodian Institute for Human Rights; Brigadier Samnang, deputy director of Cabinet at the Ministry of Defense and one of the authors of the recent Cambodian white paper on defense; Dr. Kevin Rushing, USAID's democracy and governance officer in Cambodia; Thun Saray, director of a local human rights group; David Mead, Conservation International representative and former Australian defense attache in Cambodia; and Kao Kim Hourn, executive director of the Cambodian Institute for Cooperation and Peace (CICP).

Throughout its contemporary history, Cambodia has been plagued by the existence of factionalized partisan military formations, which have aggravated political rivalries. Progress on economic, social, and political reform has been jeopardized by regular military intrusions into politics and by sizable resources (20 to 30 percent of gross national revenue) being diverted to the military. In February, however, the government accepted a white paper on defense drafted by a group of military reformers, indicating that a window of opportunity may have opened for active engagement of civilian leaders and civil society in shaping future policy toward the armed forces and defense more broadly. The purpose of NDI's assessment mission to Cambodia was to assess if in fact an opening for civil-military work had been created.

A few central themes emerged out of NDI's discussions in the field. First, there was a general consensus that the success of civil-military programs thus far, namely the demobilization program funded by the World Bank, was extremely disappointing. The World Bank committed \$45 million over two years to program, however to date only \$360,000 has been provided. Rampant corruption and inaccurate records make it extremely difficult to implement the plan. Furthermore, it merely provides funds to decommissioned soldiers; the program does not address the real issue of integrating them into society.

Second, those interviewed agreed that the Cambodian government's acceptance of a white paper on defense provided a unique opportunity for change. However, they noted that the white paper also provides several challenges for a reform program. For instance, the document does not have a mechanism for implementation. Another disadvantage of the current white paper is that it was written by a working group of senior military officers without any input from civic society.

Third, the Cambodian officials interviewed agreed that engaging society would be integral to the success of future military reform. Some believed that the white paper itself should be taken to the public, or that society should be given the opportunity to write its own. Others

did not think this was necessary, however all agreed that the inclusion of society in future reform was of paramount importance.

A fourth point that several of the interviewees agreed upon was that working with civilian women's groups, such as mothers of soldiers, might provide a successful entrée into civil-military reform.

In light of the information gathered during this assessment trip, NDI is exploring the availability of funding for a program that would enhance citizen participation in civil-military affairs in Cambodia.

### *Civil-Military Relations Assessment Mission and Program Development in Peru*

During this quarter, Busza also participated in an OTI assessment mission to Peru. Peru is currently at a critical juncture. For the first time, the military, which has undermined democratic processes by directly or indirectly intervening in politics since Peruvian independence, has been delegitimized and weakened. As a result, Peruvian civilian leaders are faced with an historic opportunity to establish genuine democratic civilian oversight of the armed forces and enact long overdue military reforms.

A feature which makes this particular period in Peruvian civil-military relations unique is the recognition by both civilians and, perhaps even more surprisingly, the military that changes and reforms need to be implemented. This consensus is reflected in some of the initiatives already launched by the transition government without any notable resistance from the armed forces.

For example, Valentin Paniagua, the transition president, and General Walter Ledesma (retired), the transition defense minister, have taken some preliminary steps to purge the military and reduce its political power. In an unprecedented step late last year, Paniagua decommissioned 16 senior generals, including a former head of the joint chiefs of staff, General Walter Chacon and former Air Force Commander General Carlos Balarezo. Paniagua allowed officers to face corruption charges and has had some-- like former Defense Minister General Victor Malca, Rear Admiral Antonio Ibarcena and most recently, former head of the Joint Chiefs of Staff General Nicolas Hermoza-- arrested on charges of illicit enrichment or narcotrafficking. The military has not taken an institutional position challenging these charges. Rather, the proliferation of public tapes exposing military collusion in state corruption seems to have convinced many in the armed forces that the institution needs to address the behavior of its officers in the recent and more distant past.

Similarly, both civilians and the military seem to recognize that in light of Peru's changing security environment ameliorated by the resolution of border disputes with Ecuador and a markedly reduced threat from guerrilla insurgents, the country needs to scale down its defense budget. The actual volume and nature of the cuts, however, have not been widely discussed. The transition leadership has already ordered a \$300 million budget cut (1/4 of the annual budget); however there is little indication that it has progressed very far in terms of

planning where these cuts should be made and why certain programs and not others should be prioritized.

Tied to the recognition of Peru's changing security environment and the need for budget cuts is a third issue that both the military and civilians agree needs to be revisited—namely the type of military service system that the country should adopt. The central question being debated is whether Peru should return to a recently abandoned conscription system or whether it should continue to build a volunteer army. Civilians tend to favor the latter while the military is arguing for the former, stressing that over the last year it has only been able to recruit one third of its targeted personnel goal.

A final issue where some consensus on the need for change is emerging relates to the justice system and, in particular, the respective jurisdictions of military and civilian courts. According to Peruvian law, civilians can be tried in a military court—particularly if the accused is charged with terrorism or narcotrafficking; while the military, regardless of their crime, are tried in military rather than civilian courts. Over the years there has been much criticism of the functioning of the military courts--openly by civilians and less openly by some soldiers who have felt that the closed nature of the military justice system has allowed political factors to intervene in the execution of justice. The Peruvian government's recent decision to retry Lori Berenson in a civilian court may be a first step toward reconsidering some of the existing norms pertaining to jurisdictional boundaries.

These indications that civilians and the military are not only willing to address issues central to the reform of civil-military relations, but have actually started these discussions are encouraging. As history shows, the prospects for real reform increase when both sides acknowledge the need for change. Nevertheless, a successful outcome in Peru is not assured, as several impediments to real change exist. These include: a lack of civilian education and expertise on security issues; the absence of institutional structures that can facilitate the exercise of democratic civilian control over the armed forces; and finally, as already discussed, a lack of consensus on the nature and depth of the reforms that need to take place.

As with many states that have a legacy of direct or indirect military rule, the level of civilian knowledge of military issues is very low. Those civilians likely to have the power to make future decisions on military and defense policy have had virtually no schooling or exposure to defense and security issues. Under previous governments, a highly restrictive secrecy policy excluded civilians from having any real input into military policy-making. A similar dearth of knowledge characterizes the press, the societal watchdog of the military in democratic states. While there are a few seasoned commentators on defense issues and the military, for the most part journalists lack the in-depth knowledge required to bring complex military issues into the public arena for public consideration and discussion.

Lack of civilian knowledge and expertise is compounded by the absence of democratic oversight mechanisms that civilians in vibrant democracies use to oversee and manage their armed forces. Thus, for example, there is no *White Paper* that defines Peru's security environment and security threats. Further difficulties arise because existing defense laws and the



whole defense budgetary review process reinforce authoritarian practices and limit congressional oversight.

In light of the political realities outlined above, NDI has developed a program that would address these impediments by providing civilians with the skills and knowledge necessary not only to exercise effective control of the armed forces but also to better engage in the discourse on the appropriate role and structure of the military.

This program would take place in two stages. The first stage would focus on the newly elected members of Congress and would begin as soon as possible after the ratification of the April congressional elections. Using local NGOs and universities and the network of international and trainers cultivated by PDGS, NDI would schedule a series of workshops and consultations throughout May, June, and July. These sessions would be based on the lesson plans developed by PDGS.

During the second stage, NDI would continue to work with members of Congress but would also expand its targeted audience to congressional staff, civilians in the Defense Ministry, journalists and actors in civil society. NDI would help congressional staff and members of the Ministry of Defense draft a White Paper informed by public debate on Peru's security concerns. The Institute would also help these officials rework existing defense legislation.

With regard to journalists, NDI's program would work through local NGOs to train members of the media on defense and security issues so that they would report more responsibly on these topics. The Institute would also encourage journalists to focus public attention on the need for military reform and restructuring. NDI is currently running a similar, successful program in Indonesia.

Finally, in its programming for civil society, NDI is proposing a number of options. These include running a series of "train the trainer" workshops for NGO activists on security and defense issues; holding small, off-the-record meetings among leading civil society activists, business leaders, parliamentarians and military officials to discuss needed changes in civil-military relations and priorities for defense and security restructuring and reform; and finally facilitating a set of regional civil-military dialogues to help diffuse civil-military tensions resulting from the military campaign against the Shining Path.

NDI's ability to implement the proposed program will depend on the interest of USAID's OTI and USAID/Peru in engaging PDGS's services for civil-military programs in Peru.

#### *Civil-Military Relations Program Development in Colombia*

In response to interest expressed by Chris Walker, a professional staff member on the International Operations Sub-committee of the Committee on Appropriations of the U.S. House of Representatives, NDI drafted a proposal for civil-military work in Colombia which was submitted to USAID in Washington.

In the proposal, NDI suggested convening a series of dialogues between civilians and military officials on the topic of what Colombians can do to repair civil-military relations and build civilian capacity to formulate and oversee defense policy in a post-conflict environment.

Proposed topics for discussion included the following:

- 1) The role of the military in a democratic society
- 2) The separation of military and police functions
- 3) How to balance military needs in a post-conflict environment with government investment in rebuilding Columbia's economy
- 4) Human rights and the military
- 5) Columbia's economic and military cooperation with its neighbors

The program would consist of monthly roundtable discussions held over the period of a year. These dialogues could in the future be expanded to include the participation of leaders from neighboring countries and from the European Union. In order to implement this program, NDI would open a small field office in Colombia. Alternatively, NDI might provide oversight and direction of the project but engage a local NGO to actually coordinate activities. NDI would also monitor the political environment and modify the agenda topics in order to ensure that they did not overstep the bounds of what would be safe to discuss in the current political environment.

#### *NDI's Security and Governance Program in Indonesia*

In August 1999, USAID's Office of Transition Initiatives provided NDI with additional incremental funding to the PDGS to conduct a civil-military program in Indonesia. More specifically, NDI was asked to conduct civilian training on defense related issues for the legislature, governing officials, and actors in various political and civic organizations. It was also encouraged to work on building the capacity of academic institutions and think tanks to research and analyze security policy and military reform.

In concordance with these program objectives, during this quarter, NDI continued to encourage public discussion and debate on defense and security issues by disseminating information on proposed defense legislation to local journalists. The Institute also initiated a partnership with the Institute of Investigative Journalism (IIJ) and began planning for a third journalists' training course.

In late February, NDI's Senior Advisor on Global Civil-Military Programs conducted an assessment of the Institute's journalist training program and a feasibility study of proposed regional dialogues between military officers and civilians in several provinces. The purpose of the mission was to assess the impact of NDI's security education workshops for journalists and to assess the feasibility of conducting a series of regional dialogues on civil-military relations in several provinces outside of Java.

Busza received a great deal of positive feedback on the NDI journalist-training program from both former participants and observers of the media. Program alumni informed her that due

to their participation in the NDI program, it was now easier for them to obtain interviews with military officers. They explained that many officers believe that journalists who have participated in the NDI program are more likely to cover their story in a fair and balanced manner. Those questioned, however, noted that editors continue to be a key stumbling block: frequently editors are simply not interested in covering security and defense issues. The journalists suggested that in the future NDI include editors in this training program to raise their awareness and increase the possibility of greater and more accurate coverage of military and security issues.

In asking respondents as to whether they thought NDI should conduct regional civil-military dialogues, the majority of the individuals interviewed acknowledged while there are difficult and important civil-military issues to be resolved at the local level, NDI should continue to concentrate its work at the national level. They gave two reasons for this: 1) TNI decision-making remains firmly in the capitol and local commanders follow Jakarta's lead on political issues and, 2) NGOs in the provinces may be reluctant to address military issues due to fear of retribution.

For more details on Indonesia program activity, please see attached Indonesia security and governance quarterly report.

#### *Lunch Working Groups at NDI*

In an on-going effort to educate NDI staff about global civil-military issues, the civil-military relations program has initiated a series of discussions. These working groups aim to emphasize the importance of civil-military relations in democracy-building. In addition to highlighting the significance of improved civil-military relations, these discussions encourage staff to provide their opinions regarding strengthened NDI programming in this field. There will be nine such discussions during the year. Topics discussed this quarter include post-cold war security environments, the compatibility of democracy and security, and women and conflict.

### **IV. RESULTS AND ACCOMPLISHMENTS**

During this quarter, PDGS adhered to its work commitments as specified in its third year workplan.

### **V. EVALUATION**

NDI expended much effort this quarter on fostering interest among USAID missions to support civil-military programs around the world. USAID missions lack of interest in some cases other fear of the political sensitivity of the program continue to be the greatest impediments to NDI's ability to develop a vibrant civil-military program.

### **VI. FUTURE ACTIVITIES**

By the summer of 2001, the PDGS will have completed and posted on the web 20 resource papers written over the past two and a half years. The PDGS will continue to improve

its website, increasing the number of on-line educational materials and resource documents available to policymakers, journalists, civil society groups, universities and political activists. During the remaining seven months of the cooperative agreement, the PDGS will complete a one-week training manual for civilians aimed at providing information that will help them develop and strengthen their oversight of the armed forces and security. In the event that USAID does not provide additional funding to renew the PDGS partnership, NDI must be prepared to pursue private foundations and corporations to sustain its civil-military programs. If interest cannot be generated, then unfortunately, the only US-funded global program that focuses on building civilian capacity to oversee the armed forces and manage defense and security policy will be terminated.